

### **Educating Bodies in Ancient Christianity**

Instructor: Susan Harvey

Office: Shirley Miller House 304, 59 George St.

tel. x3-3572 (o); x3-3104 (messages); 401-726-0686 (h)

email: Susan\_Harvey@Brown.edu

Office hours: Wednesdays, 9:00-10:30 a.m. and by appointment

#### **Description**

Education in the ancient Mediterranean world served multiple purposes. It formed citizens, moral and ethical agency, and religious identities. It took place in a variety of settings and through diverse disciplinary methods, physical, intellectual, and social. This course will examine the primary modes of instruction through which ancient Christians undertook self-formation: the family, the civic community, monasteries, and liturgical communities. Comparative attention to pagan and Jewish practices.

#### **Requirements:**

1. Attendance and careful preparation for close discussion of assigned texts and background reading. This class will be run as a seminar: each and every person is responsible for our class sessions.

2. A research paper (15-20 pgs. for undergraduates; 25-30 pgs. for graduate students), due by Dec. 19. Topics must be chosen by 10/10 in consultation with the instructor; thesis abstract and annotated preliminary bibliography due 10/31. Assignment and suggested topics on p. 7 of this syllabus.

3. Grades will be figured on this scale:

In-class participation 30%

Paper topic (preparation and meeting) 5%

Abstract + annotated bibliography 15%

Final paper 50%

#### **Required books (Available in the Brown Bookstore, and also available on Reserve at the Rockefeller Library)**

Gillian Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*

Wendy Mayer and Pauline Allen, *John Chrysostom*

Robert Gregg, *Athanasius: The Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellinus*

Benedicta Ward, *The Sayings of the Desert Fathers: the Alphabetical Collection*

A.F. Norman, *Antioch as a Center of Hellenic Culture as Observed by Libanius*

Robert Doran, *Stewards of the Poor: The Man of God, Rabbula, and Hiba in Fifth-century Edessa*

Adam Becker, *Sources for the Study of the School of Nisibis*

**Other Required Readings** are marked "OCRA" and are available at the Brown University Library website, through the OCRA link: <http://dl.lib.brown.edu/reserves/> or on the Canvas website for this course. The class password for RELS 1325A is: **educating**.

**All students are required to adhere to Brown's Academic Code:**

**[http://brown.edu/Administration/Dean\\_of\\_the\\_College/curriculum/academic\\_code.php](http://brown.edu/Administration/Dean_of_the_College/curriculum/academic_code.php).**

**ALL READINGS GIVEN ARE REQUIRED FOR THE DATE SHOWN.****Course Plan and Assignments:****Sept. 9 Religion, Family, Education**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 1, pp. 1-15  
 C. Osiek, "Family Matters", in *A People's History of Christianity*, Vol 1: *Christian Origins*, ed. R. Horsley (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2005), pp. 201-20. (OCRA)  
 J. Shelton, "Education", in Shelton, *As the Romans Did: A Sourcebook in Roman Social History* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1988), pp. 104-126. (OCRA)  
 R. Kaster, "Controlling Reason: Declamation in Rhetorical Education at Rome," in *Education in Greek and Roman Antiquity*, Yun Lee Too, ed. (Leiden: Brill, 2001), pp. 317-37. (OCRA)

Recommended: J. Kloppenborg, "Literate Media in Early Christ Groups: the Creation of a Christian Book Culture," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 22.1 (2014): pp. 21-59. (OCRA)

**Sept. 11 Self and Others**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 2, pp. 16-37  
 M. Mauss, "Techniques of the Body" from Jonathan Crary and Sanford Kwinter, *Incorporations* (New York: Zone, 1992), 455-77. (OCRA)  
 Justin Martyr, First Apology (esp. intro., ch. 1-20 and 46-68; pp. 23-6, 33-56, 83-107), trans. T.B. Falls, FC 6 (Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America, 1965) (OCRA)

**Sept. 16 Communities Within Communities**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 3 (first part), pp. 38-53  
 C. Bell, *Ritual Theory, Ritual Practice* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1992), Ch. 5, "The Ritual Body", pp. 94-117. (OCRA)  
 Tertullian, To his Wife, Bk. 2, trans. W. P. LeSaint, *Tertullian: Treatises on Marriage and Remarriage*, ACW 13 (Westminster, MD: Newman Press, 1951), pp. 23-36. (OCRA)  
 Tertullian, "Spectacles", intro., ch. 1-4, ch. 15-30; and "the Apparel of Women," intro, Bk 1, ch. 1, and Bk. 2; both in *Tertullian: Disciplinary, Moral and Ascetical Works*, trans. R. Arbesmann and E.A. Quain FC 40 (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1959), pp. 33-107 [pp. 33-43, 47-57, 83-107], and pp. 111-49 [pp. 111-5, 117-8, 129-49]. (OCRA)

**Sept. 18 Christians in the World**

- B. Leyerle, "Children and 'the child' in Early Christianity," *The Oxford Handbook of Childhood and Education in the Classical World*, ed. J. Evans Grubbs and T. Parkin (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2013), pp. 559-79. (OCRA).  
 Mayer and Allen, *John Chrysostom*, Intro., pp. 3-16.

John Chrysostom, "On Vainglory", trans. M. L. W. Laistner, *Christianity and Pagan Culture in the Later Roman Empire* (Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1951), pp. 85-122 (OCRA)

J. Spier, "The Earliest Christian Art: From Personal Salvation to Imperial Power," in Spier, *Picturing the Bible: the Earliest Christian Art* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press/ Fort Worth: Kimbell Art Museum, 2007), pp. 1-23 (OCRA)

### Sept. 23      **New Communities (Egypt)**

Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 4, pp. 60-77

Gregg, *Athanasius: the Life of Antony*, (Intro., pp. 1-26), 29-99.

Ward, *Sayings of the Desert Fathers*, xiii-xxvii (intro.), 1-19 (Antony, Arsenius)

### Sept. 25      **The City Revised**

Gregory of Nyssa, "The Life of St. Macrina," trans. V.W. Callahan, *Saint Gregory of Nyssa: Ascetical Works*, FC 58 (Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 1967), pp. 161-97. (OCRA)

Gregory of Nazianzus, "On his sister, St. Gorgonia", in *Gregory Nazianzen and Ambrose, Funeral Orations*, trans. L.P. McCauley, FC 22 (Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 2004), pp. 101-118 (OCRA)

Ward. *Sayings of the Desert Fathers*, pp. 82-4 (Theodora), 229-35 (Sarah, Syncletica)

Clark, Ch. 4, "Domesticity and Asceticism," in G. Clark, *Women in Late Antiquity: Pagan and Christian Lifestyles* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993), pp. 94-118 (OCRA)

C. Bell, *Ritual Theory, Ritual Practice* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1992), Ch. 9, "The Power of Ritualization", pp. 197-223 (OCRA)

## Sept. 30-Oct. 2, Guest Scholar: Prof. Caroline Schroeder (Univ. of the Pacific)

### Sept. 30      **New Communities, New Families (Egypt)**

Ward, *Sayings of the Desert Fathers*: Arsenius 15, Ammos 1; Abraham 3; Apollo 2; Gelasius 1; Daniel 7; Zacharias (all); Theodore of Pherme 1; Theophilus 2; Theodora 5; John the Dwarf 41; Isaac 5; Carion (all); Macarius 5, 6, 15, 24, 37; Mark 3; Olympius 2; Poemen 2, 5, 7, 76, 155, 173, 176; Paphnutius 4; Sisoës 10, 18.

C. Schroeder, "Queer Eye for the Ascetic Guy: Homoeroticism, Children, and the Making of Monks in Late Antique Egypt," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 77 (2009): 333-47. (OCRA)

"Pachomian Koinonia 1", "Pachomian Koinonia 2": Pachomian *vitae* and rules, selections: 1<sup>st</sup> Greek life 49-50, 2<sup>nd</sup> Sahidic Life fragments 2, 10; Parilopomena 15; Pachomius Precepts 1, 139, Precepts and Judgments 7 (OCRA)

selections from Schroeder, *Monks and their Children* (monograph in progress) (OCRA)

Recommended: C. Schroeder, "Child Sacrifice in Egyptian Monastic Culture: From Familial Renunciation to Jephthah's Lost Daughter," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 20.2(2012): 269- 302 (OCRA)

**Oct. 2            Educating the Community (Egypt)**

- John Cassian, selections *Conferences* 2.7, 24:26, and *Institutes* 4.27 (OCRA)  
 R. Krawiec, "Monastic Literacy in John Cassian: Toward a New Sublimity" *Church History* 81.4 (2012): 765-95. (OCRA)  
 R. Cribiore, *Gymnastics of the Mind: Greek Education in Hellenistic and Roman Egypt* (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 2005), 1-9, 15-28, 45-56, (56-65 recommended), 65-73 (OCRA)

**Oct. 7            The City Revisited**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 5, pp. 78-92  
 Norman, *Antioch as a Center of Hellenic Culture*, pp. xi-xviii, 70-109, 111-121, 169-92.  
 E. Watts, "The Student Self in Late Antiquity" in *Religion and the Self in Late Antiquity*, ed. D. Brakke, M.L. Satlow, S. Weitzman (Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 2005), 234-51 (OCRA)

**Oct. 9            Educating Christians**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 6, pp. 93-117.  
 Mayer and Allen, *John Chrysostom*, pp. 17-40 (intro.), 126-31 (Baptismal Instruction), 184-95 (Philogonus), 104-117 (On the Statues), 168-76 (On I Cor., Hom. 12).

**Oct. 14          City Streets**

- Clark, *Christianity and Roman Society*, Ch. 3 (end), pp. 54-9  
 N. Andrade, "The Processions of John Chrysostom and the Contested Spaces of Constantinople." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 18.2 (2010): 161-89 (OCRA).  
 Mayer and Allen, *John Chrysostom*, pp. 41-52 (intro), 85-97 (On Martyrs), 148-67 (Against the Jews), 118-25 (Against Games and the Theater)

**Oct. 16          The Christianized City (Edessa)**

- Doran, *Stewards of the Poor*, xi-xix (intro), pp. 3-38 (The Man of God), 41-105 (Rabbula)  
 S. A. Harvey, "Praying Bodies, Bodies at Prayer Ritual Relations in Early Syriac Christianity," *Prayer and Spirituality in the Early Church*, Vol. 4: *the Spiritual Life*, ed. P. Allen, L. Cross, and W. Mayer (Sydney: St. Paul's Publications, 2006), pp. 149-67. (OCRA)

**Oct. 21          Modes of Self-Formation: the Psalms**

- Gregg, *Athanasius, the Letter to Marcellinus*, pp. 101-29.  
 McKinnon/ Strunk, "Early Christian Views of Music", in *Source Readings in Music History: the Early Christian Period and the Latin Middle Ages*, ed. J. McKinnon (New York: W.W. Norton, 1998), pp. 11-23 (OCRA)  
 P. Kolbet, "Athanasius, the Psalms, and the Reformation of the Self," *Harvard Theological Review* 99 (2006): 85-101 (OCRA).  
 A.B. Wylie, "Musical Aesthetics and Biblical Interpretation in John Chrysostom," *Studia Patristica* 32 (Leuven: Peeters, 1997), pp. 386-92 (OCRA)

**Oct. 23: Guest Scholar: Prof. Arthur Urbano (Providence College)****Oct. 23 Self-Presentation**

- Dio Chrysostom, Or. 72: On Personal Appearance (Loeb ed. about 10 pages in English)  
 Gregory of Nazianzus, Or. 25 "In Praise of Hero the Philosopher"; and Or. 43: "Funeral Oration on Basil", ch. 11-25, *Gregory Nazianzen and Ambrose, Funeral Orations*, trans. L.P. McCauley, FC 22 (Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 2004), pp. 157-74, pp. 35-50 (OCRA)  
 P. Zanker, *The Mask of Socrates: the Image of the Intellectual in Antiquity* (Berkeley: Univ. California Press, 1995), pp. 277-84, 297-306  
 A. Urbano, "Sizing Up the Philosopher's Cloak: Christian Verbal and Visual Representations of the Tribon," in K. Upson-Saia, C. Daniel-Hughes, Batten (eds.), *Dressing Judeans and Christians in Antiquity* (Ashgate, 2014), 175-94 (OCRA)

**Oct. 28 Liturgical Formation**

- G. Downey, "Empire and Body of Christ: the Divine Liturgy," in Downey, *Constantinople in the Age of Justinian* (Norman, OK: Univ. of Oklahoma Press, 1960) (OCRA)  
 A.M. Yasin, "Sacred Space and Visual Art," and G. Peers, "Object Relations: theorizing the late antique viewer," both in *The Oxford Handbook of Late Antiquity*, ed. S. F. Johnson (Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012), pp. 935-69 and 970-93. (OCRA)

**Oct. 30 Liturgy as Continuing Education**

- D. Krueger, "Christian Piety and Practice in the Sixth Century", in M. Maas, *The Cambridge Companion to the Age of Justinian* (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2005), pp. 291-315. (OCRA)  
 G. Frank, "Romanos and the Night Vigil in the Sixth Century," in *A People's History of Christianity*, Vol. 3: *Byzantine Christianity*, ed. D. Krueger (Minneapolis, Fortress, 2006), pp. 59-78. (OCRA)  
 Romanos, Kontakia: "On the Nativity", "On the Harlot", trans. E. Lash, *St. Romanos the Melodist: Kontakia on the Life of Christ* (HarperCollins, 1995), pp. 1-12, 75-84. (OCRA)  
 Jacob of Sarug, "On Partaking of the Holy Mysteries" trans. A. Harrak (Piscataway, NJ: Gorgias Press, 2009) (OCRA).

**Week of Nov. 4-6 Guest Scholar: Prof. Michael Satlow (Brown University)****Nov. 4 Jewish Formation in Late Antiquity**

- M. Satlow, *Creating Judaism: History, Tradition, Practice* (New York: Columbia Univ. Press, 2006), pp. 115-39 (OCRA)  
 A. Shinan, "Synagogues in the Land of Israel: the Literature of the Ancient Synagogue and Synagogue Archaeology," in S. Fine, ed., *Sacred Realm: the Emergence of the Synagogue in the Ancient World* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press/ Yeshiva Univ. Museum, 1996), pp. 130-152 (OCRA)  
 C. Hezser, "Private and Public Education," in Hetzer, *The Oxford Handbook of Jewish Daily Life in Roman Palestine* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2010) (OCRA).  
 S. Fine, "Jewish Art and Biblical Exegesis in the Greco-Roman World," in J. Spier, *Picturing the Bible: the Earliest Christian Art* (2007), pp. 24-49. (OCRA)

**Nov. 6            Rabbinic Formation**

- D. Boyarin, *Carnal Israel: Reading Sex in Talmudic Culture* (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1995), pp.134-166 (OCRA)
- M. Jaffee, *Torah in the Mouth: writing and oral tradition in Palestinian Judaism, 200BCE – 400 CE* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2001), pp. 84-99 (Ch. 5, “The Ideological Construction of Torah in the Mouth”), pp. 126-56 (Ch. 7, “Torah in the Mouth”, Epilogue). (OCRA)
- M. Satlow, “ ‘And on the Earth You Shall Sleep: Talmud Torah and Rabbinic Asceticism,” *Journal of Religion* 83 (2003): 204-225. (OCRA)

**Nov. 11            Monastic Schools: the Case of the School of Nisibis (i)**

- Becker, *Sources for the Study of the School of Nisibis*, pp. 1-16 (intro.), 40-160 (Barhadbeshabba, Eccles. Hist. and “The Cause of the Foundation of the Schools”)

**Nov. 13            the School of Nisibis (ii)**

- Becker, *Sources for the Study of the School of Nisibis*, pp. 21-39 (Simeon of Bet Arsham)
- A. Vööbus, *The Statutes of the School of Nisibis* (Stockholm: ETSE, 1961) pp. 50-105 (the Canons; Syriac and English) (OCRA).
- A. Becker, *Fear of God and the Beginning of Wisdom: The School of Nisibis and the Development of the Scholastic Culture in Late Antique Mesopotamia* (Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2006), pp. 155-209, 258-73 (Ch. 8, Ch. 9, Conclusion; notes). (OCRA)

**Nov. 18            student presentations**

**Nov. 20            student presentations**

**Week of Nov. 25            \*\*\* NO CLASS – Thanksgiving break\*\*\***

**Dec. 2            student presentations**

**Dec. 4            student presentations**

**Term Paper assignment**

**Topics chosen in consultation with course professor: week of 10/6.**

**Research assignment: write up your paper topic (including the thesis you intend to argue) in a 1-2 pg. abstract, with attached annotated bibliography: due by 10/31.**

Your **presentation** will be based on your **rough draft**, which you will make available to the class by **noon on the day before you will be presenting** (send by email attachment to Prof. Harvey, who will circulate to entire class). **Each student must prepare a written critique and comment (1-2 pg.) for each rough draft;** prepare two copies: one for the professor and one for the student presenter.

**Final papers are due Friday Dec. 19 by 4:00 p.m.**

You are free to choose your own topics. Areas of inquiry to consider might be, for example:

Training regimens in the Sayings of the Desert Fathers (e.g., fasting/ food; sensory training;)

Biblical culture in the Sayings of the Desert Fathers, or other monastic communities, or other social context

Augustine of Hippo, Confessions – education as programmatic of the Christian Life

Ascetic women scholars: the circles around Jerome

Women's convents and intellectual life  
e.g. Life of Febronia; Life of Syncletica

Philosophical holy men (Neoplatonist; Neopythagorean)

Teachers/ disciples

Early Christian art: church decoration; household decoration